#### Eliminate the Use of DSA and Region in Kidney Allocation Policy

**OPTN Kidney Transplantation Committee** 

#### Proposal Timeline – June 2018 to Present



#### What Problems will this Proposal Address?

- 1. DSA and Region not optimized for organ distribution
  - Final Rule: geography shall not impact candidate access to transplant, except to the extent necessary (e.g. avoid unnecessary organ loss / promote efficient management of organ placement)
- 2. Geographic disparity in access to transplant
  - DSA largest factor related to disparity in kidney allocation

#### Hybrid Framework

- What is the "hybrid" framework?
  - Single fixed-distance circles with proximity points
  - The single fixed-distance circle is based on the distance from the donor hospital to the candidate's place of listing
  - One proximity point is equivalent to one year of waiting time
  - Proximity points only affect rank-ordering of candidates within classifications
- Committee modeling focused on "hybrid" framework
  - Reflects public comment feedback (preference for hybrid)
  - Inclusion of proximity points promotes efficiency within broader distribution
  - Smaller proximity points values eliminated from consideration after showing negligible effect in first KPSAM modeling



Distance (NM) from Donor Hospital to Waiting List Candidate (Listing Center)

#### **Proximity Points and the Final Rule**



#### **Overview: Proposed Solution**

- Hybrid Framework with proximity points
- 500 NM fixed circle around the donor hospital
- Maximum of four proximity points inside the circle
- Maximum of eight proximity points outside of the circle
- Added medical urgency classification and review process
- Import match run: New match run would be based on a 150 NM circle

## DSAs Were Drawn as Boundaries for OPOs to Recover Organs, not for Equitable Organ Distribution Purposes



Donation Service Areas

#### Regions Vary in Geographic Size, and are not Consistently Applied or Rationally Determined Units of Distribution



# Disparities in Adjusted Median Waiting Time (Kidney)



#### KPSAM Modeling (2<sup>nd</sup> Round)

Model Number	Scenario	Circle Size: KI	Circle Size: KP/PA	Inner Circle Maximum Points	Outside of Circle Maximum Points
BL-ped	BL-ped (Baseline)	Local/Regional/National	L/R/N	NA	NA
2	500.500.0.8	500	500	0	8
3	500.500.4.8	500	500	4	8
4	500.150.0.8	500	150	0	8
5	250.250.2.4	250	250	2	4
6	250.250.0.8	250	250	0	8
7	250.150.0.8	250	150	0	8
8	150.150.0.8	150	150	0	8
9	150.150.0.20	150	150	0	20
10	500.500.step150	500	500	4* (flat from 0- 150NM)	8
11	500.500.step250	500	500	4* (flat from 0- 250NM)	8

#### Acceptance Model Update

- Initial KPSAM report included local (DSA) indicator in offer acceptance models, potentially impacting change in transplant count/rate
  - Including DSA as a key predictor of acceptance behavior may result in inaccurate predictions for a future system that does not rely on DSAs for organ distribution.
- SRTR identified alternative acceptance models without local indicator for Committee to evaluate
- Committee determined acceptance model should include donor only criteria

### Increased Pediatric and Prior Living Donor Priority

Sequence A	Sequence B	Sequence C	Sequence D	
KDPI 0-20%	KDPI 20-34%	KDPI 35-85%	KDPI 86-100%	
100% Highly Sensitized	100% Highly Sensitized	100% Highly Sensitized	All Highly Sensitized	
Inside circle prior living	Inside circle prior living	Inside circle prior living	0-ABDRmm	
donor	donor	donor	Inside circle safety ne	
Inside circle pediatrics	Inside circle pediatrics	98-99% Highly Sensitized	Inside circle	
98-99% Highly Sensitized	98-99% Highly Sensitized	0-ABDRmm	National	
0-ABDRmm	0-ABDRmm	Inside circle safety net		
Inside circle top 20% EPTS	Inside circle safety net	Inside circle		
0-ABDRmm (all)	Inside circle adults	National		
Inside circle (all)	National pediatrics			
National pediatrics	National adults			
National (top 20%)				
National (all)				

#### Variation in Kidney Transplant Rates by DSA



#### **Overall Transplant Counts**

Variation	KI Transplant Counts	KP Transplant	Total KI Transplants	KI Change from BL	KP Change from BL	Total KI Change
		Counts	(KI & KP)			from BL
BL- Current KAS	13062	822	13884			
BL- Peds Priority	13080	815	13895			
500.500.0.8	12748	1111	13859	-2.5%	36.3%	-0.3%
500.500.4.8	12766	1122	13888	-2.4%	37.3%	-0.1%
500.150.0.8	12965	937	13902	-0.9%	15.0%	0.1%
250.250.2.4	12830	1056	13886	-1.9%	29.6%	-0.1%
250.250.0.8	12832	1052	13884	-1.9%	29.1%	-0.1%
250.150.0.8	12945	945	13890	-1.0%	16.0%	0.0%
150.150.0.8	12915	970	13885	-1.3%	19.0%	-0.1%
150.150.0.20	12946	966	13912	-1.0%	18.5%	0.1%
500.500.step150	12720	1118	13838	-2.8%	37.2%	-0.4%
500.500.step250	12727	1124	13851	-2.7%	37.9%	-0.3%

#### Reducing Disparities Across DSA (Kidney)



DSA



#### Medical Urgency and Import Back Up

- Medical Urgency
  - Create a new "Medically Urgent" classification in existing allocation tables
  - Create a prospective review process with a four (4) day turnaround on review.
    Reviewed by new Kidney Committee subcommittee
- Import Backup
  - Host OPO can choose to delegate "Import Backup"
  - New match run utilizing a fixed 150 NM circle around the original intended recipient's transplant program
  - Proximity points utilized <u>only outside</u> of 150 NM fixed circle

#### **Review: Proposed Solution**

- Removes DSA and region from kidney allocation policy as measures of distribution while striking an appropriate balance with the Final Rule requirements
  - Limits geography as factor in organ allocation
  - Considers efficiency concerns by including steep proximity points
  - Promotes access for vulnerable populations
- Framework represents a step in the direction of continuous distribution

#### What Else Did The Committee Consider?

- Fixed Distance Circles
  - Community preferred a hybrid approach in the first round of Public Comment
- Alternative Hybrid Variations (Smaller Circles, Less Proximity Points)
  - Modeling revealed more variability in access across DSA with smallest allocation circles
  - Smaller maximum proximity points had minimal effect in efficiency