

**OPTN Policy Oversight Committee
Benefit Scoring Subcommittee
Meeting Summary
November 30, 2022
Conference Call**

Lisa Stocks, RN, MSN, FNP, Chair

Introduction

The Benefit Scoring Subcommittee (“Subcommittee”) met via Citrix GoToMeeting teleconference on 11/30/2022 to discuss the following agenda items:

1. Review of Potential Changes
2. Next Steps

The following is a summary of the Subcommittee’s discussions.

1. Review of Potential Changes

The POC is charged with prioritizing and sequencing new OPTN projects brought forth from committees. Staff reintroduced the key topics the Subcommittee had discussed at their previous meeting.

Presentation summary:

The Subcommittee is devising a method of scoring project benefit which differentiates between the impacts of potential new projects, empowering the Policy Oversight Committee (POC) to help prioritize more effectively. The goal is to create a model to objectively score benefit to review new projects unbiasedly.

From the previous discussion, Staff noted that strategic plan alignment would be removed from the scoring model.

Summary of discussion:

A member supported removing the strategic plan alignment from the scoring model. They suggested that the Subcommittee could brainstorm on ideas to fill in that gap rather than simply reallocating strategic plan alignment’s benefit weight to the other areas.

Staff asked whether policy priorities within the identified OPTN Policy Priorities that are over-allocated should receive benefit for aligning with that policy priority. Three members felt that it should be a binary choice of whether a policy aligns with any of the policy priorities, regardless of whether it is over-allocated.

Staff also inquired who should be charged with scoring potential projects; this could be done by the POC, by the sponsoring committee, some combination thereof, or possibly a new subcommittee. A member felt that it did not make sense to have the sponsoring committee score their own project if the intent is to have an unbiased scoring mechanism. Additionally, they considered that the benefit of having the POC score is that the POC can provide a larger scale perspective when considering the policy. However, they supported having the committee submit a score and a justification to facilitate the POC’s review – the POC can determine whether they agree with the committee’s assessment or not.

It was suggested that the committee should be responsible for providing objective measurements (population size impacted, number of candidates with a specific condition, etc.) to further facilitate the POC's review of projects.

Next steps:

Staff will update the project form the POC reviews according to the discussion decisions.

2. Next Steps

Staff considered next steps for the Subcommittee, as well as the scheduling for the following meetings.

Summary of discussion:

Staff wondered if there was an element that should be included instead of OPTN Strategic Plan, or whether its weight should be moved to another element. A member proposed that the weight of that element be equally distributed among the other elements as a short-term solution.

A member asked how the weighting was initially decided on. Staff explained that it was based off an analytical hierarchy processing exercise that the POC took in early 2021. The feedback from that exercise was then reviewed by the POC, and, with minor adjustments, became the weights.

It was suggested that project forms include a section for the sponsoring committee to indicate how important the project is. This would allow more transparency into the urgency of a specific proposal across different committees. Furthermore, it was give the POC reviewers a better sense of how necessary a specific proposal is considered by experts within that field.

Next steps:

Staff will distribute invitations to the next Subcommittee meetings.

Upcoming Meeting

- TBD

Attendance

- **Committee Members**
 - Jesse Schold
 - Nicole Turgeon
 - JD Menteer
 - Oyedolamu Olaitan
 - Peter Stock
 - Kimberly Koontz
- **HRSA Representatives**
 - Jim Bowman
 - Marilyn Levi
 - Vanessa Arriola
- **UNOS Staff**
 - Cole Fox
 - Isaac Hager
 - Darby Harris
 - James Alcorn
 - Lauren Mauk